Pratt's Journal of Bankruptcy Law

LEXISNEXIS® A.S. PRATT®

SEPTEMBER 2015

EDITOR'S NOTE: INSOLVENCY: A GLOBAL SUPPLY CHAIN DISRUPTOR Steven A. Meyerowitz

GLOBAL SUPPLY CHAINS AND FREE TRADE AGREEMENTS:
A SUGGESTED VEHICLE FOR HARMONIZATION OF
INSOLVENCY AND CONTRACT-ENFORCEMENT LAWS
Patrick E. Mears, Christoph G. Paulus, and Shinjiro Takaqi

IN RE JEVIC HOLDING CORP.: THIRD CIRCUIT APPROVES SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND STRUCTURED DISMISSAL THAT DEVIATE FROM BANKRUPTCY CODE'S PRIORITY SCHEME Abigail L. Lerner and Blaire Cahn

S.D.N.Y. DISTRICT COURT HOLDS TRUST INDENTURE ACT LIMITS ABILITY OF ISSUER TO RESTRUCTURE BONDS OF DISSENTING BONDHOLDERS OUTSIDE OF BANKRUPTCY

Lisa M. Schweitzer, Kara A. Hailey, and Matthew L. Rappoport

ONWARD, CHRISTIAN SOLDIERS: SOME GUIDANCE ON 363 SALES, FAIR AUCTIONS, AND PROPOSED SALES TO INSIDERS Doron P. Kenter

JUDGMENT CREDITORS: HOW BUILDING A STRONG RECORD DURING CITATION PROCEEDINGS CAN PAY DIVIDENDS IN BANKRUPTCY

James P. Sullivan, Bryan Jacobson, and Sara Ghadiri

ACTIONS SPEAK AS LOUDLY AS WORDS IN *DEPRIZIO* WAIVERS David A. Wender and William Hao



QUESTIONS ABOUT THIS PUBLICATION?

For questions about the Editorial Content appearing in these volumes or reprint permission, please call:
Kent K. B. Hanson, J.D. at
Email: kent.hanson@lexisnexis.com
For assistance with replacement pages, shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call:
Customer Services Department at
Outside the United States and Canada, please call (518) 487-3000
Fax Number
Customer Service Web site http://www.lexisnexis.com/custserv/
For information on other Matthew Bender publications, please call
Your account manager or
Outside the United States and Canada, please call (518) 487-3000

Library of Congress Card Number: 80-68780

ISBN: 978-0-7698-7846-1 (print) ISBN: 978-0-7698-7988-8 (eBook)

Cite this publication as:

[author name], [article title], [vol. no.] Pratt's JOURNAL OF BANKRUPTCY LAW [page number] ([year])

Example: Patrick E. Mears, *The Winds of Change Intensify over Europe: Recent European Union Actions Firmly Embrace the "Rescue and Recovery" Culture for Business Recovery*, 10 Pratt's Journal of Bankruptcy Law 349 (2014)

This publication is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

LexisNexis and the Knowledge Burst logo are registered trademarks of Reed Elsevier Properties Inc., used under license. A.S. Pratt is a registered trademark of Reed Elsevier Properties SA, used under license.

Copyright © 2015 Reed Elsevier Properties SA, used under license by Matthew Bender & Company, Inc. All Rights Reserved.

No copyright is claimed by LexisNexis, Matthew Bender & Company, Inc., or Reed Elsevier Properties SA, in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work. Permission to copy material may be licensed for a fee from the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, Mass. 01923, telephone (978) 750-8400.

An A.S. Pratt® Publication

Editorial Offices 630 Central Ave., New Providence, NJ 07974 (908) 464-6800 201 Mission St., San Francisco, CA 94105-1831 (415) 908-3200 www.lexisnexis.com

MATTHEW & BENDER

Editor-in-Chief, Editor & Board of Editors

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

STEVEN A. MEYEROWITZ

President, Meyerowitz Communications Inc.

EDITOR

VICTORIA PRUSSEN SPEARS

Senior Vice President, Meyerowitz Communications Inc.

BOARD OF EDITORS

Scott L. Baena Bilzin Sumberg Baena Price & Axelrod LLP Thomas W. Coffey
Tucker Ellis & West LLP

Matthew W. Levin Alston & Bird LLP

Leslie A. Berkoff *Moritt Hock & Hamroff LLP*

Michael L. Cook Schulte Roth & Zabel LLP Patrick E. Mears
Barnes & Thornburg LLP

Ted A. Berkowitz
Farrell Fritz, P.C.

Mark G. Douglas

Jones Day

Alec P. Ostrow
Stevens & Lee P.C.

Michael L. Bernstein Arnold & Porter LLP Timothy P. Duggan Stark & Stark

Deryck A. PalmerPillsbury Winthrop Shaw
Pittman LLP

Andrew P. BrozmanClifford Chance US LLP

Gregg M. Ficks Coblentz, Patch, Duffy & Bass LLP N. Theodore Zink, Jr. Chadbourne & Parke LLP

Kevin H. Buraks
Portnoff Law Associates,

Mark J. Friedman
DLA Piper

Peter S. Clark II

Robin E. Keller

Reed Smith LLP Lovells

PRATT'S JOURNAL OF BANKRUPTCY LAW is published eight times a year by Matthew Bender & Company, Inc. Copyright 2015 Reed Elsevier Properties SA., used under license by Matthew Bender & Company, Inc. All rights reserved. No part of this journal may be reproduced in any form—by microfilm, xerography, or otherwise—or incorporated into any information retrieval system without the written permission of the copyright owner. For permission to photocopy or use material electronically from *Pratt's Journal of Bankruptcy Law*, please access

www.copyright.com or contact the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc. (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, 978-750-8400. CCC is a not-for-profit organization that provides licenses and registration for a variety of users. For subscription information and customer service, call 1-800-833-9844.

Direct any editorial inquires and send any material for publication to Steven A. Meyerowitz, Editor-in-Chief, Meyerowitz Communications Inc., 26910 Grand Central Parkway, No. 18R, Floral Park, NY 11005, smeyerowitz@meyerowitzcommunications.com, 718.224.2258. Material for publication is welcomed—articles, decisions, or other items of interest to bankers, officers of financial institutions, and their attorneys. This publication is designed to be accurate and authoritative, but neither the publisher nor the authors are rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services in this publication. If legal or other expert advice is desired, retain the services of an appropriate professional. The articles and columns reflect only the present considerations and views of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the firms or organizations with which they are affiliated, any of the former or present clients of the authors or their firms or organizations, or the editors or publisher. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Pratt's Journal of Bankruptcy Law*, LexisNexis Matthew Bender, 630 Central Avenue, New Providence, NJ 07974.

Judgment Creditors: How Building a Strong Record During Citation Proceedings Can Pay Dividends in Bankruptcy

By James P. Sullivan, Bryan Jacobson, and Sara Ghadiri*

This article discusses a recent U.S. Court of Appeal for the Seventh Circuit opinion, which teaches an important lesson for judgment creditors. Although it may be costly to create a detailed record post-judgment, doing so can pay dividends in proceedings involving a dishonest judgment-debtor, including a subsequent bankruptcy.

The issuance of a Citation to Discover Assets against a judgment-debtor often represents the first step a creditor will take to collect on a civil judgment in state court. However, the citation may also trigger the judgment-debtor to file a bankruptcy petition, thus temporarily foiling a creditor's collection efforts. However, a creditor who is diligent in building a record during the citation proceedings has a chance of a greater recovery in a subsequent bankruptcy. Judgment-debtors must tell the truth under oath, no matter the court, and the transition of post-judgment proceedings from a state court to a bankruptcy court does not relieve a judgment-debtor of this burden. Further, creditor may have grounds to object to the judgment-debtor's bankruptcy discharge should it be found that the judgment-debtor has not kept his or her story straight between the state court citation proceedings and the bankruptcy case.

IN RE CAROL A. MARCUS REHTMEYER

An excellent illustration of this concept is found in the U.S. Court of Appeal for the Seventh Circuit's recent opinion in *In re Carol A. Marcus Rehtmeyer*.¹ After judgment was entered against Carol Marcus Rehtmeyer ("Rehtmeyer") in a breach of contract case, one of her creditors, Chivalry Consulting, Inc. ("Chivalry"), issued a citation to discover assets along with a rider directing Rehtmeyer to produce a variety of documents relating her income (the "Citation"). During an examination under oath pursuant to the Citation, Rehtmeyer provided only tax returns and no other responsive documents. After substantial legal wrangling, Rehtmeyer responded that she did not possess any

^{*} James P. Sullivan is a partner and Bryan Jacobson and Sara Ghadiri are associates in Chapman and Cutler LLP's Litigation, Bankruptcy and Restructuring Group. The authors may be contacted at jsulliva@chapman.com, bjacob@chapman.com, and ghadiri@chapman.com, respectively.

¹ No. 14-1891 (7th Cir. Apr. 28, 2015).

documents relating to bank accounts held in her name, and in particular, she had no documents pertaining to mortgages or deeds of trust. Frustrated, Chivalry filed a motion for a rule to show cause; however, the day before the hearing, Rehtmeyer filed for bankruptcy, never having produced the requested documentation.

Upon reviewing Rehtmeyer's bankruptcy filings, Chivalry quickly realized that the bankruptcy documents directly contradicted the information Rehtmeyer provided during the state-court citation proceedings. For example, in the bankruptcy court, Rehtmeyer stated that she held mortgaged real property, despite having previously sworn under oath that she had no mortgage documents. She also listed certain personal property, including stocks and computer equipment, as personal property, all of which had been asked for, but none of which had ever been disclosed, in the prior citation proceedings. Most egregiously, Rehtmeyer's Statement of Financial Affairs filed with the bankruptcy court listed income that was never disclosed in the post-judgment proceedings. These were not mere omissions, but substantial, material, and purposeful contradictions. Chivalry, having spent the time and effort creating a robust record in the citation proceedings, objected to Rehtmeyer's discharge of her debt under 11 U.S.C § 727(a)(2)(A).²

Rehtmeyer offered several excuses for the inconsistencies, explaining that she may not have had assets or known the extent of them at the date of the citation examination, and thus did not know to provide the information to opposing counsel. The bankruptcy court conducted a trial, agreed with Rehtmeyer, and denied Chivalry's objections. The district court affirmed.

THE SEVENTH CIRCUIT DECISION

On appeal, the Seventh Circuit reversed the lower courts' rulings, relying on the record established during the citation proceeding. The court emphasized that debtors subject to a citation are under a continuing duty to disclose financial information truthfully, regardless of when during the proceeding the information may have become available. This continuing duty is apparent from the statue governing citation proceedings, the citation rider, and the Bankruptcy Code. The court chastised Rehtmeyer, noting that "it belies reason to think that anyone, particularly a person represented by counsel, would think

² Section 727 of the Bankruptcy Code allows a party to object to a debtor's discharge where the "debtor, with intent to hinder, delay, or defraud a creditor . . . has transferred or concealed or has permitted to be transferred . . . or concealed property of the debtor within one year before the date of the filing of the [bankruptcy] petition."

that she need not disclose employment or associated income as an asset."³ As the Court pointed out, "it would be nonsensical then, to allow a judgment debtor . . . to avoid the discovery of assets by merely stating that she could not recall precisely when she received particular assets, or that she did not receive the assets by the time the citation was first issued."⁴ Under Illinois law, Rehtmeyer was required to truthfully divulge all payments made to her from the date the citation was issued until the date it expired. Under the Bankruptcy Code, her duty was the same: to provide truthful information to the bankruptcy court and her creditors. The striking inconsistencies in her disclosures made it clear to the Court that Rehtmeyer had been concealing documentation relating to her financial wherewithal in violation of 11 U.S.C. § 727(a)(2)(A).

THE LESSON

The lesson of *Rehtmeyer* is that although it may be costly to create a detailed record post-judgment, doing so can pay dividends in proceedings involving a dishonest judgment-debtor, including a subsequent bankruptcy. It is hard to catch a liar in a lie, and harder still to prove it. A complete record allows a creditor to do both, and places it in the best position to object to the bankruptcy discharge of a judgment-debtor who is attempting to conceal his or her assets from collection.

³ Rehtmeyer, No. 14-1891, slip op. at 18.

⁴ *Id.* at 15.